ECA/PAMM/HRP/86/9[6.1(w)]

MANPOWER AND EMPLOYMENT PLANNING PROCESSES IN BOTSWANA

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

November 1986

ECA/PAHM/HRP/86/9/[6.6(iv)]

ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

MANPOWER AND EMPLOYMENT PLANNING PROCESSES IN BOTSWANA

November 1986

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	1
	Macro-Overview of the Socio-Economic Conditions	1
	The Problem to be Addressed	2
II.	HUMAN RESOURCES ISSUES POLICIES AND STRATEGIES	3
	Human Resources Development: Education and Training	3
	Employment: Human Resources Utilization	8
III.	INSTITUTIONAL AND STAFFING ARRANGEMENTS FOR MANPOWER AND EMPLOYMENT PLANNING IN BOTSWANA	15
1.	Institutional Structure	15
	(a) Advisory/Consultative Bodies	17
	The National Employment, Manpower and Income Council (NEMIC)	17
	The Minimum Wages Advisory Board	18
	The Salary Review Commission	19
	Wages Policy Committee	20
	National Industrial Training and Technical Education Committee	21
	(b) Government Cross-sector Manpower lanning Organs	21
	The Directorate of public service Management (DPSM)	21
	Employment Policy Unit (EPU)	23
	The Central Statistical Office (CSO)	24
	The Department of Labour and Social Security	24
	(c) Government Sectoral Manpower Planning Organs	25
	Department of Health Manpower Development and Utilization	25
	The Department of Unified Local Government Service Management	26
2.	Staffing	27
IV	MANPOWER AND EMPLOYMENT PLANNING ACTIVITIES IN BOTSWANA	31

	Pages
The National Manpower Development Planning Activity	31
Public Secor Manpower Budgeting	32
Employment Surveys	33
Labour Force Survey	34
Education Survey	34
National Workshops and Seminars	35
Studies	36
V EFFECTIVENESS OF THE PROCESS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR THE FUTURE	36
Major Observations	36
Suggestions for strengthening national human resources planning capabilities	38

List of Tables

Table 1:	Junior Secondary, Senior Secondary and Post-Secondary School Enrolment, 1971-1981	4
Table 2:	Occupational Manpower Requirements and Additional Citizens Required by 1990 and 2001	5
Table 3:	Manpower Requirements by Education and Training Level Projected to 2001	6
Table 4:	Labour Force, Employment and Unemployment 1984/85	10
Table 5:	Public Service Employment by Nationalization and Grade Levels, 1981	11
Table 6:	Establishment, Employment, and Vacancies by Ministry, September 1986	12
Table 7:	Number of Public Sector Managerial, Professional and Technical Post available for Manpower and Employment Planning in Botswana: 1985/86 and 1986/87	28

I. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1. Macro-Overview of the Socio-Economic Conditions

The Republic of Botswana is landlocked with a total land area of 582,000 square kilometers. The 1981 census put the population estimate at about 967,300 which stood at an estimated 1,131,700 persons in 1986. Given present growth trend (3.4 per cent), this figure is expected to reach 1,356,941 and 1,894,193 by the years 1991 and 2001 respectively.[1/] This rapid population growth results from the co-existence of high fertility rates rising from 5.6 per cent in 1971 to 7.1 per cent in 1981, and a rapidly declining infant mortality rates dropping from 102 to 63 per thousand livebirths between 1971 and 1981.[2/] With at least 47 per cent of the population below age 15, the labour force is expected to average well above 3 per cent growth over the next five to ten years bringing greater presure on the Government to provide employment opportunities for the old and new job seekers.

The economy is equally growing at a high rate though loosing its grips in the rural areas. In 1966, total Gross Domestic Product (GDP) at current market prices stood at 36.8 million pulas with agriculture contributing nearly 40 per cent of the total. During the 1982/83 fiscal year, GDP had risen to 997.1 million pulas with the share of agriculture declining to 7.4 per cent loosing its leadership to mining (28.7 per cent) and trade and hotels (22 per cent). The volume of trade has correspondingly increased over the years with imports being continously higher than exports. Diamonds exports have become the major foreign exchange earner in place of beef exports.

Along with a changing and expanding economy, there has been manifold increase in employment in the various sectors of the economy. In 1966, there were approximately 6,000 public service employees rising to 38,000 by 1983 and reaching nearly 45,000 in 1986. Formal sector employment has been growing rapidly since the mid-seventies, averaging over 7 per cent per year, and absorbing about 20 per cent of the total labour force. The number and cost of non-Botswana employed continue to increase in magnitude in response to the shortage of skilled knowledgable and experienced nationals required for national development.

1/ National Development Plan 1985-91; MFDP, Gaborone, December 1985, p.9.

2/ Ibid., p.11.

A striking point about the increasing use of non-citizen is the development challenge the strategy poses for the Government of Botswana in relation to the distribution of national income. For example, nearly a fourth of all wage and salary earnings in the country accrue to non-Batswana workers.[1/]

Also, as a result of the changes in the magnitude and trend of economic activities, the Government has intensified its planning efforts which has now cumulated into the Sixth National Development Plan. For the period 1985 through 1991 (NDP6). These planning efforts are aimed at achieving further "rapid economic growth", "social justice" "economic independence" and "sustained development"[2/]. Within this framework, the Government has established, as the nation's highest development priority, the creation of productive employment and rural development.

2. The Problem to be Addressed

The desire to pursue the above development objective foster the birth to what could be regarded as the beginning of systematic human resources development and utilization planning process in Botswana Government commissioned a Manpower Survey. The survey provided a statistical reference document on the status of employment and manpower together with other relevant information which were intended to be used as a guide for planning education and training programmes. On the basis of the survey findings, employment creation targets and other associated measures for redressing a number of manpower imbalances in the Botswana labour market have been identified by Government. Government's human resources planning effort was put into a better framework following a number of major developments: The establishment of the National Employment Manpower and Incomes Council (NEMIC) and the Employment Policy Unit to serve as its technical aim provided a national advisory and coordinating body. Secondly, the Government established a national manpower development planning activity with mandate to provide a national picture of the labour market situation and its future prospects. For the public sector, a manpower budgeting process was introduced with the objectives to optimize the distribution and use of scarce human resources, and to rationalize and monitor the growth rate of public service employment. Manpower planning activities have also been intensified in the Directorate of Public Service Management, the Department of Labour, the Central Statistical Office,

---

1/ Ibid., p. 19

2/ These are the four major national planning objectives centred around four national principles: democracy, development, self-reliance and unity. See NDP6, p.56.

The Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Education and the Department of Unified Local Government Service. In short, elements of a manpower and employment planning process are put in place.

A major question which however lingers on is how effective is the process with regards to its management, and to its capabilities for planning and programming manpower planning development and utilization activities; and how best these functions could be strengthened. This study is an attempt to consider the above question with the aim to assisting the Botswana Government in strengthening the management functions of human resources' planning, development, allocation and deployment for national development. Accordingly, the paper is divided into five sections including this section. Manpower and employment issues together with Government policies and strategies to deal with them are highlighted in section two. This is followed by a discription of existing institutional arrangements for manpower and employment planning. The effectiveness of the process is examined in the fourth section while the final section contains a few suggestions for the future.

The paper has its limitations. First, it is basically a desk study and hence, the required information for its enrichment was not available as one would have wished. Secondly, the time alloted for gathering the information and for writing the report was short in relation to the task the paper intends to perform. Notwithstanding, the issues and findings outlined in this paper could serve as a useful base for future study on the status and effectiveness of manpower and employment planning processes in Botswana.

II. HUMAN RESOURCES ISSUES POLICIES AND STRATEGIES

1. Human Resources Development: Education and Training

Adequate analysis of the educational, vocational and technical training needs have been made by the Government and achievable goals established [1/]. A number of issues and potential problem areas in relation to the management of manpower development planning have emerged from the analysis [2/]. First is the issue of co-ordination of the various activities within themselves and with other activities undertaken in other sectors

---

1/ For an excellent summary of these analysis, see charter 6, pp 123-167 of NDP6.

2/ Though these are indications to suggest that Government is fully aware of these managerial issues, policies and institutions required to ensure effective co-ordination are yet to evolve in a coherent manner.

such as health, agriculture, industry, etc. Secondly, the process of human resources development is a costly one in terms of finding qualified trainers/ teachers and adequate funds to provide the required facilities and training workshops. Like for most other African countries, these requirements are scarce in Botswana which them imposes the condition that whatever process the Government evolves, it should be forward-looking and cost-effective in its operation. Thirdly, the planning and management of human resources development process ought to be centered around making education and training more responsive to the nation's manpower needs; ensuring an effective programme of career guidance; and improving the quantity and quality of teachers and trainers.

Also emerging from the analysis are a number of technical issues and problem areas that have direct implications for the planning of manpower. These relate broadly to the rising trend of school enrolment, the wastage rates and the meeting of future manpower requirements.

Enrolment is expanding at all levels and such expansion need to be directed to areas of manpower shortages. According to available statistics, total junior secondary school enrolment is expected to grow by at least 7 per cent between 1985 and 1990. For the senior secondary and post secondary levels, enrolment is expected to grow between 1985 and 1990, by 28.4 per cent and 12.2 per cent respectively [1]. The absolute corresponding estimates of these growth trends are presented in the following table:

Table 1: Junior Secondary, Senior Secondary and Post-Secondary School Enrolment, 1971-2001

Levels	1971	1981	1985	1986	1990	1996	2001
Jr. Secondary	5100	17016	26756	29112	30097	60590	79490
Sr. Secondary	628	3132	4305	4233	15251	25902	34975
Post-Secondary	204	1210	1589	1569	2925	3052	3249
Certificate/Dol.	(54)	(473)	(537)	(409)	(377)	(441)	(557)
1st degree	(130)	(710)	(960)	(1177)	(2320)	(2320)	(2320)
Post-1st degree	(10)	(35)	(61)	(82)	(228)	(291)	(372)
Total							

Source: Table 14, National Manpower Development Planning, 1985.

1/ See Table 14 in National Development Planning 1985, MFDP, Gaborone, 1985, p.24.

The repeat rates are very high. However, there are speculations, based on diagnostic test and consultations carried out by and between Officials in the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, that the repeat rate in Standard four is expected to decline from the 1984 level of 13 per cent to 5 per cent by 1991, and the repeat rate in Standard seven to decline from 25 per cent to about 16 per cent during the same period. This problem is also compounded by a progressively rising dropout rate from Standard one upwards. Available statistics gives a calculated dropout rates as 0.0185 for Standard one, 0.0095 for Standard two, 0.0261 for Standard three, 0.0547 for Standard four, 0.0441 for Standard five, and 0.471 for Standard six -[1/].

Thirdly, planning for education and training must be done in the light of the future manpower requirements and skill needs. By the years 1990 and 2001, more than 66,000 and 238,000 Batswana will be needed respectively to occupy various occupational areas in which vocational training efforts will have to be directed as shown in the Table below:

Table 2: Occupational Manpower Requirements and Additional Citizens Required by 1990 and 2001

Occupational Categories	1990		2001		
	Manpower required	Additional citizens required	Manpower required	Additional citizens required	
Scientists, Engineers and Technicians	3058	2226	6989	5663	
Medical Personnel	3585	1679	7164	5637	
Mathematicians, Statisticians, Economists and Accountants	1671	946	3218	2637	
Teachers	16374	8783	29705	23627	
Social Workers	1128	556	2999	2540	
Other Professionals and Technical Workers	1139	644	2240	1803	
Managers and Administrators	4235	2609	9789	7487	
Clinical, Sales, Service and Agricultural Workers	59292	22470	115531	78140	
Production and Related Workers	68090	26063	135511	101360	
Total	159422	65975	312148	230122	

Source: Table 15, National Manpower Development Planning 1985, MFDP

1/ See Table 14 in National Development Planning 1985, MFDP, Gaborone, 1985, p.24.

The situation portrayed in the above Table would become serious if account is taken of existing vacancies in the entire economy, attrition from the workforce, Government's localization policies, and the need to upgrade the skill level of existing laboour. It is even more serious if one looks at the magnitude of total projected manpower requirements for the entire economy classified by education and training levels.

Table 3: Manpower Requirements by Education and Training Level Projected to 2001

	1984	1985	1990	1991	1996	2001
Less than JC	119099	145487	200690	209650	289790	410741
JC or Form 4	5430	6509	8566	8910	11952	16396
Form 5 GCE	291	432	610	648	949	1446
O Level	2093	2353	2720	2769	3407	4163
A Level	91	98	132	139	184	245
Degree or Higher	1441	1652	2103	2194	2751	3458
Plus JC	28371	30548	38935	40609	51625	65933
Training JC, Form 4	9554	10269	13081	14057	19181	25304
and Form 5+	20704	22907	31803	34014	43104	54798
Total	187964	221331	299534	313600	423023	582403

Source: Table 20, National Manpower Development Planning 1985.

The implications of the above managerial and technical issues and problem areas for education and training programming and development are enormous. Facilities will have to be expanded and distributed in the various region. Incentive measures to direct students in the various occupational fields will have to be initiated and course content and structures re-adjusted. Appropriate policies and institutions to establish and manage a comprehensive manpower development sub-system will have to be instituted and enforced. Objectives and strategies for manpower development will have to be clearly specified within the framework of overall national development strategies and objectives.

The Government of Botswana is fully aware of these implications and has taken some measures to deal with them. Efforts to obtain up-to-date data on the inputs to and outputs from the education and training sector are well underway through the joint efforts of the Central Statistical Office and the Ministry of Education. It is anticipated that such information would guide policy makers and education planners in the allocation and distribution of

scarce resources within the sector. Besides the Government has clearly defined the objectives of its education and training programmes in the light of the issues raised above.

As broad education objectives for the period between 1985 and 1991 the Government of Botswana has expressed desire and pledged its commitment to prepare Batswana for useful and productive lives increase educational opportunities for all age groups within the limits of resources, promote co-ordination between various sub-sector of the education system, and strengthen co-operation between school and the community. Consequent upon these objectives, the following education priorities set by the Government, are to be vigoriously pursued throughout the present plan period -1/:

- achievement of universal access to primary education;
- increased access to post-primary education, in particular secondary and technical/vocational education;
- growth of university enrolments related to the nation's manpower needs;
- improvement of the quality of education with particular emphasis on science education;
- expansion of non-formal education activities to complement formal education.

Strategies for achieving these objectives as spelt out in the National Development Plan include the intensification of vocational and technical training, expansion of relevant existing courses and the introduction of additional courses at the University. Elements of the strategy include increasing the supply of trained teachers, expanding in-service training for serving teachers and the decentralization of education administration with emphasis placed on better co-ordination of personnel, effective use of school facilities and quicker response to educational problems. Also the Government intends to encourage community participation in education by (a) sharing of responsibility with regards to the provision of school facilities, and (b) adopting school curricula to community life, (c) making school facilities available for community use and (d) getting the community involved in the running of the schools.

1/ National Development Plan, 1985-1991; MFDP; Gaborone, December 1985, p.125.

On the issue of vocational and technical education, the Government's objective is to promote adequate numbers of suitable qualified citizenes within the context of rural development and employment creation. Technical and vocational training in Botswana is undertaken by a number of agencies, and covers a wide range of activities. Private and parastatals enterprises, Government institutions and departments and non-governmental and international organizations are all actively involved in sponsoring training programmes. Collectively they offer training opportunities in varying degrees and forms in at least 70 different centres. 1/

These and other efforts need to be encouraged and strengthened particularly given the severe shortages of many types of indigenous skilled manpower. As a start, measures have been initiated to ensure that vocational and technical training programmes do not cater only to the formal and urbanized sectors; but also to the provision of skilled manpower needed in rural areas; and a vocational and technical training development strategy adopted. As part of the strategy, existing training institutions will be expanded to cater for the needs of Government and the private sector. Four new regional vocational training centres to train artisian level workers are to be completed by 1991 at Selebi-Phikwe, Jwaneng, Palapye and Maun. Also to be established are an Industrial Training and Trade's Testing Centre, and a Teacher Training and Educational Facility.

Other aspects of the strategy is the Government's willingness to support initiatives by local organizations and foreign donors to expand training programmes within the framework of the newly enacted Apprenticeship and Industrial Training Legislation and the USAID sponsored Botswana Workforce and Skills Training Project. In addition, steps to strengthen the institutional arrangements for ensuring proper monitoring and evaluation of vocational and technical training programme in Botswana have been put in motion. Notably among the institutions to be strengthened are the Tripatite Committee on Technical and Vocational Training; the National Industrial and Technical Education Committee; the National Advisory Board for Apprenticeship and Industrial Training; the Manpower Sub-Committee of the National Employment, Manpower and Incomes Council.

2. Employment: Human Resources Utilization

The provision of adquate employment opportunities for most of the nation's unskilled labour and the shortages of skilled manpower for many of the activities demanded by an expanding economy continued to be the major employment problems facing Botswana.

To better understand the nature of the employment problems, Government has initiated periodic studies on the labour force and the labour market. Policy guidance and co-ordination organs are instituted by the Government to ensure the effective utilization of the nation's human resources.

1/ See the "National Manpower Development Planning, 1985" for a non-exhaustive list of these various types of training programme, p.25.

A deeper analysis of these two fundamental problems expose a series of issues that are of utmost concern to the nation's manpower and employment planners. It should be indicated that the two problems and their associated issues are not unique to the Republic of Botswana as they are also found in the labour markets of nearly all African countries. However, in the case of Botswana, the problems are mainly aggravated by the fact that relatively, the levels of educated and trained manpower and the systems that could produce them started from a very low base at independence.

Government is greatly concerned with the shortage of effective employment opportunities for the growing labour force. The 1984/85 Labour Force Survey and the various Employment Surveys are partial testimonies of this concern. In addition, results of these would assist with the identification and formulation of policies and strategies to deal with the problem.

According to the 1984/85 Labour Force Survey, there were approximately 275,000 persons classified as employed with 122,000 or nearly 50 per cent of these engaged in traditional agriculture. During the survey period, there were more than 25 per cent of the labour force that were not working, wanted to work, and were available for work. Almost two-thirds of these were females with most of them living in the rural areas. Despite the very rapid growth in GDP and cash employment, there were fewer people in 1981 (down by negative 4.6%) who were actively engaged in family agriculture than in 1971; and many more people (up by 12.3 per cent between 1971 and 1981) listed as economically inactive or actively looking for work[1/]. There are indicators such as the rates of urbanization and population growth and the expansion of the mining sector, etc. which suggest that the above employment pattern have not changed significantly during the last five years.

In terms of full employment opportunities, the survey indicates that between 60 and 70 per cent of the labour force were faced with inadequate opportunities to be engaged in productive activities. Though efforts to expand productive employment have been constrained by factors referred to as "laws and regulations to protect society's interest and management and personnel policies", [2/] the level of employment in the formal sector of the economy has been rising over the years. For example, it rose from 41,300 in 1972 to about 97,000 in 1981 representing a 57 per cent increase in ten years. Under the development projection senario in NDP6, aggregate formal sector employment, self-employment and domestic servants is expected to rise from 178,235 in 1985/86 to 235,621 in 1990/91 implying an average growth of 5.7 per cent.

1/ J. Salkin, "National Manpower Planning", Paper presented to the National Manpower Planning Seminar, 24-26 May, 1983, Memeo, p.2.

2/ National Manpower Development Planning 1985, MFDP, Gaborone, 1985, p.3.

Table 4: Labour Force, Employment and Unemployment 1984/85

	Male	Female	Total
Traditional Agriculture	55,400 (32.1%)	66,100 (33.9%)	121,500 (33.0%)
Fully Employed formal and Informal Sectors	57,900 (33.4%)	34,800 (17.8%)	92,600 (25.2%)
Other Fully Employed	800 (0.4%)	600 (0.3%)	1,400 (0.4%)
Disguised Underemployed	17,700 (10.2%)	16,800 (8.6%)	34,500 (9.4%)
Visible Underemployed	7,500 (4.3%)	17,100 (8.8%)	24,600 (6.7%)
Other Employed	200 (0.1%)	100 (0.1%)	300 (0.1%)
Unemployed Actively Looking for Work	23,100 (13.4%)	34,600 (17.8%)	59,700 (15.7%)
Not Actively Looking for Work	10,200 (5.9%)	25,000 (12.8%)	35,200 (9.6%)
Total Unemployed	33,300 (19.2%)	59,800 (30.6%)	93,100 (25.3%)
Total Labour Force	172,000	195,200	368,000
Not in Labour Force Aged 12 Plus	73,700	141,300	215,000

Source: Table 2, National Manpower Development Planning, 1985.

Seen against a rapidly growing labour force, this picture is encouraging as attested to by the following observations in the Sixth National Development Plan.

> "While the percentage of the labour force with job opportunities in Botswana rises from 32.5 per cent in 1985/86 to 36.1 per cent in 1990/91, the percentage of the labour force with work opportunities at home or abroad rises from 37.2 per cent to 38.6 per cent over the period. In addition the proportion of the working age population in school is projected to rise from 7.5 per cent in 1985/86 to 9.6 per cent in 1990/91. Thus the remainder of the labour force, without employment or self-employment opportunities or in school will decline from 53.3 per cent in 1985/86 to 51.8 per cent".

Both the Fifth and Sixth National Development Plans emphasized employment creation as an essential and priority development objective. Within this context, employment opportunity generation programmes and strategies are viewed not only as instruments for maximizing formal sector employment, but also as instruments for increasing economic opportunities in the broadest sense to embrace agriculture, industry, education, training, wildlife resources, health and public sector activities in general 1/. These considerations are reflected in the work and recommendations of the Presidential Commission on Economic Opportunities; the Financial Assistance Policy; the National Manpower Planning Policy; and the Incomes Policy.

The second important human resources utilization problem facing the Government is the shortages of critical manpower within the economy. One of the resulting issues of interest for manpower and employment planning is the economy's heavey dependence on very expensive imported skills to carry out the various managerial and productive activities. In 1981, the dependency ratio in the public service was well over 30 per cent. This situation has since reduced in magnitude with the exception being in areas requiring science-based professions where, according to a 1983 study, there were about 50 Batswana with degrees and 240 with diplomas compared to 150 expatriates degrees and another 150 with diplomas.

Table 5: Public Service Employment by Nationalization and Grade Levels, 1981

Grade Level	Total	Batswana	Non-Batswana	% of Expatriates
Super Scale	165	116	49	30
General Administrators	703	631	72	10
Professional	459	192	270	59
Technicians	646	418	229	35
Others	121	-	121	-
Total	2,103	1,363	740	35

* Includes 121 Experts/Advisors for whom salary information was lacking on 23 July 1981.

Source: Tables II, C.4, National Manpower Development Planning, 1982: A First Report.

1/ "National Development Plan 1985-1991", MFDP, Gaborone, 1985, pp.63 and 64.

Another resulting issue relates to the high vacancy rates in many Government Departments and the private and parastatal sectors. As at September 1986, 22,065 posts in central governments were filled out of 24,125 approved establishment posts leaving 2,217 posts vacant.

Table 6: Establishment, Employment, and Vacancies by Ministry
September 1986

Ministry	Establishment	Employment		Vacancies
		Batswana	Non-Botswana	
Parliament	68	63	0	5
State President	3,119	2,921	44	157
Finance & Dev. Planning	1,295	1,121	50	124
Labour & Home Affairs	1,468	1,374	11	84
Agriculture	1,909	1,710	71	159
Education	10,520	9,181	557	803
Commerce & Industry	505	405	37	73
Local Gov't & Lands	491	413	39	50
Works & Communications	1,835	1,550	100	237
Mineral Res. & W. Affairs	633	475	66	124
Health	1,974	1,442	130	356
Admin. of Justice	110	79	10	21
Atty General Chambers	71	53	6	12
Auditor General	46	35	4	7
External Affairs	59	58	0	1
Specified Officers	14	6	4	4
Total	24,125	20,886	1,179	2,217

Source: Directorate of Public Service Management Statistical Bulletin.

An associated issue which aggrevates the vacancy problem and certainly one which constrains manpower and employment planning in Botswana is the rapid labour turnover particularly in the private sector. 1/ The cost to society is indeed

1/ Pantao, P., "Manpower Planning for the Private Sector," paper presented to National Manpower Planning Seminar, 24-26 May, 1986 Gaborone, p.2.

tremendous when one takes into account the training costs plus the loss to production which occurs between the time a worker leaves and when another is found and trained to do the required job.

The question of skilled manpower shortage has created both employment and manpower development problems problems for the Botswana Government. On the employment side, the shortage has led to either the employment of high cost expatriates or to the deferrement of activities or to the undertaking of activities by unqualified workers with a concomittant loss of productivity and/or effectiveness. On the development side, the Government is torn between allocating resources for expanding educational and training facilities on the one hand, and making their structures and contents relevant in accordance to the needs of societies and the economy.

Co-existing with the issue of shortages are the issues of surplus unskilled labour which is expected to increase in the next five years, low labour productivity, and limited jobs in the formal and informal urban and non-agricultural rural sectors [1]. Given the rapid growth of Gaborone and Francistown, the ultimate impact of these three issues has given rise to a greater employment problem in the form of urban employment estimated at nearly 30 per cent and "underemployment" amongst those "involved in family agriculture particularly during the low period of the annual agriculture cycle" [2].

The Government has initiated policies and programmes to deal with the above human resources utilization problems and issues. Notably, is the 1972 National Incomes and Employment Policy which arose out of the need to (i) secure a rapid expansion of employment opportunities, and (ii) promote an equitable distribution of income and wealth with particular focus on reducing income differentials between unskilled and skilled persons, and between urabn and rural dwellers. With these in mind, the principal objectives of the policy is to expand the number of employment opportunities available for the unskilled while minimizing the growth in demand for scarce skilled manpower and simultaneously expanding the supply of such skilled manpower. Other objectives of the policy are (i) to reduce the growth in differential between urban and rural incomes; (ii) to prevent competition for scarce skilled, technical, professional and managerial manpower, (iii) to ensure that unrealistically high wage did not curtail the rate of investment in new jobs; and (iv) to reduce growth in Government services [3].

Over the years a strategy has evolved to bring about the realization of these objectives. As indicated earlier, broad elements of the strategy are contained in three major Government policy actions that are closely linked to the National Incomes and Employment Policy.[4]

1/ Peat, J., "Manpower Planning and Employment Policy"; paper presented to National Manpower Planning Seminar, 24-26 May, 1983, Gaborone, p.2.
2/ Ibid, p.3.
3/ Colclough, C. and Olsen, P.J., "Review of Incomes Policy in Botswana, 1972-1982," 1983, Gaborone, pp. 13 and 14.
4/ Activities undertaken through these measures will be highlighted later in the paper.

(a) The Presidential Commission on Economic Opportunities :- The Commission was set up to, among other things, examine the effectiveness of Government's policies for employment promotion and citizen participation in the development process. On the basis of four guiding principles, the Commission made specific recommendations for boosting the quality and relevance of education, encouraging small-scale and arable agriculture with emphasis on diversification, industry and commerce; and increasing productivity of Government expenditures and the efficiency of manpower use.

(b) The Financial Assistance Policy (FAP) :- This programme was launched in 1982 as a component of the employment creation strategy and involves Government's financial allocation to productive activities that have greater job creation potentials. Basic to this strategy is the "ultimate and fundamental objective to generate additional economically viable activities and hence employment opportunities" 1/

(c) National Manpower Planning :- This programme is aimed at ensuring that the "limited supply of skilled manpower is allocated where it is most needed" and that "education and training programmes respond to the long-term needs of the economy" 2/. The programme is crystalized within the context of the national manpower development planning activity, the manpower budgeting process for the public sector and various manpower and employment studies and surveys.

As a strategy to deal with surplus unskilled labour, the Presidential Commission suggested the establishment of a labour intensive employment fund to do for the public and parastatal sectors what the FAP is to do for the private sector. Under such a scheme, the Government is to withhold half of expected unskilled labour cost out of departmental budgets and place the amount in a special fund to be drawn on when needed. On the other hand, strategy to alleviate the shortage of skilled manpower have also included the granting of tax incentives. The provision allows firms to deduct as much as 200 per cent of the value of approved "off-the-job" training costs in determining liability for corporate tax. Suggested also is a training levy system to complement the resources Government is presently devoting to training 3/.

A major point which needs to be stressed is that the policies and strategies initiated to ensure efficient and equitable development and use of scarce

---

1/ Peat, J., "Manpower Planning and Employment Policy", paper presented to National Manpower Planning Seminar, 24-26 May, 1983, p.1.

2/ National Development Plan 1985-1991, MFDP, Gaborone, 1985, p.66.

3/ The extent to which these recommendations have been implemented is not known to the author.

skilled manpower by the different sectors are plagued with what Paul Rantao calls "contradictions" resulting from the allocation of manpower on the one hand, and the neglect of the private sector manpower needs by the training institutions and Government Departments on the other. According to Rantao:

> "Whilst commendable progress has been achieved in terms of efficient use scarce resources planning and the setting of objectives, organisation, control, communication etc. to sustain economic stability and productivity in the country as a whole, the same could hardly be said with regard to the crucial question of efficient and equitable use of scarce skilled manpower by different sectors - agriculturalists have been diplomats, biologists communicators, doctors managers, lawyers administrators, chemists finance officers etc. Whilst on the one hand trade unionists and politicians have been exerting pressure on the private sector to localise and lend respectability or status to those trained, on the other hand the principal training institutions i.e. university, the Botswana Institute of Administration and Commerce, the Botswana Institute of Development etc. have hitherto either concentrated on public sector training or provided inadequate and sometimes irrelevant programmes to meet the needs of the private sector." 1/

The issues raised in this section can be summarized as follows: (i) the process of planning human resources development in Botswana should be forward looking, cost effective and be aimed at ensuring that the policies strategies and programmes would bring into balance the quantative, qualitative and productivity demands of the economy and society; (ii) the process should contain structures and approaches that would scientifically redress the delimma posed by the simultaneous existence of critical manpower shortage on the one hand, and a surplus of unskilled and semi-skilled unemployed members of the labour force on the other. The implication of these for the Government is obvious: Greater commitment to human resources management planning. As shall be shown in the next section, much of this commitment has been demonstrated on the part of the Government.

III. INSTITUTIONAL AND STAFFING ARRANGEMENTS FOR MANPOWER AND EMPLOYMENT PLANNING IN BOTSWANA

1. Institutional Structure

The first serious attempt at scientific national manpower planning in Botswana started in 1972 when the Government commissioned a Manpower Survey to provide a statistical reference document on employment and manpower which could be used as guide for planning education and training programmes. A great deal of work has been done since then to develop elements of a human resources management system and machinery. Many enterprises have established

---

1/ Rantao, P. "Manpower Planning for the Private Sector", paper presented to the National Manpower Planning Seminar, 24-26 May 1983, Gaborone, p.2.

their own manpower development units to deal particularly with their personnel and training needs. Many Governmental departments have likewise established manpower planning capabilities to look after their own manpower requirements, or those of other sectors they deal with. Both central and local government sectors have machineries to help plan human resources development and utilization. According to NDP6, responsibility for co-ordinating the manpower plans of private and parastatals firms rest with the Department of Labour in the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs while the Directorate of Public Service Management [1] and the Unified Local Government serviceco-ordinate the Central Government and Local Government respectively.

What remains a major discussion by officials in respect of establishing an institutional machinery for manpower and employment planning is the form and structure such a machinery should take. This issue was fully discussed during the 1984 Manpower Planning Workshop when participants considered the question as to whether the manpower planning function should be placed in a central planning department or ministry, or whether it should be decentralized to a line ministry [2]. What emerged during the debate was that though decentralization is an ideal move, factors such as the shortage of qualified manpower planners and the need for integration of manpower planning activities made the creation of a central manpower planning unit more desirable and a necessity. This notwithstanding, participants could not agree on whether such a unit should be an integral part of the central economic planning machinery or whether it should be autonomous. The debate still lingers on, but will have to be resolved in the face of new development challenges.

With a rapidly expanding economy and a growing population demand, the Government is faced with a delimma vis-a-vis the development of an effective human resources management machinery. On the one hand individual manpower planning organs in the country are compartmentalized and would put up a resistance to remain so. On the other hand, the growing complexities of the Botswana labour market in terms of skill mix, productivity, the generation and dissemination of labour market information etc. demand an integrated and comprehensive machinery in the light of available resources and capacities. The last section of this paper will consider the impact and implications of this delimma and advance a few suggestions for dealing with it. In this section, we shall review the nature functions and delivery capabilities of the existing arms of the machinery with a view to better understand the workings of the process. Those arms to be reviewed fall into three broad categories: (a) Advisory/consultative bodies; (b) Government cross-sector manpower planning organ; and (c) Government sectoral manpower planning organ.

1/ Until 1 November 1986, this office was known as the "Directorate of Personnel".

2/ "Report on Manpower Planning Workshop", IDM, April 1981, Gaborone, p.8.

(a) Advisory/Consultative Bodies

(i) The National Employment, Manpower and Income Council (NEMIC)

As a direct result of the 1972 Manpower study commonly known as the "Colclough Report", the National Employment, Manpower and Incomes Council was established. The Council, which is a tripatite advisory body with membership drawn from Government, employers and employees' organizations, is to review, co-ordinate and make recommendations on all aspects of manpower, employment and income policies and programmes. The Council is to place emphasis on developing measures that would increase productivity and encourage the creation of new jobs together with programmes for training and localization [1].

Specifically, NEMIC is expected to:[2]

(i) review overall trends in incomes, prices and profits in the light of national policy and make recommendations as appropriate;

(ii) review Government's plans for education and vocational training in the light of present and projected national skilled manpower requirements and make recommendations to the Ministry of Education;

(iii) advise Government on the optimum allocation of available local skilled manpower between sectors in the light of national development and localization objectives;

(iv) assess the level and scope of training in Botswana of citizens, by private and parastatal sectors, and make policy recommendations to Government.

Following a period of inactivity, the Council was reactivated and strengthened in March 1981 by way of three new developments: First, the Council's membership was amended to include representatives from the rural sector, a move which is in line with Government's development priority objective. Secondly, the Manpower Sub-Committee and the Incomes Sub-Committee were established with representatives from Government, employees and employers, to provide a forum through which the Council's work is to be done.

1/ ECA, "Report on Mission to Botswana", 3-11 March, 1981 by S.B. Jones; p.4.

2/ Extracted from Colclough, C., and Olsen, P.J.; "Review of Incomes Policy in Botswana: 1972-83" p.28 and IDM, "Report on Manpower Planning Workship" 13-15 April, 1981, Gaborone, p.58.

The third major development was the creation of the Employment Policy Unit in the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning to serve as the technical secretariat to the Council [1]. Not only did these moves enhanced the technical and political capabilities of the Council, they also brought into focus the relationship between human resources planning and the achievement of national development objectives.

The manpower sub-committee is chaired by the Permanent Secretary for the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs. It is expected to:

(i) advise Government on the formulation of plans and programmes of an inter-ministerial character relating to manpower resources;

(ii) review proposed development programmes and projects of individual ministries or departments relating to manpower resources in order to advise government on the inter-ministerial coordination of programmes and projects;

(iii) serve as a forum for the interchange of information and views among Ministries and departments on matters relating to manpower resources;

(iv) promote closer coordination among ministries or departments in the implementation of their programmes and projections relating to manpower resources.

The Incomes Sub-Committee is to co-ordinate and monitor the various aspects of the Incomes Policy. As part of its specific responsibilities, the Sub-Committee is expected to review the structure, level and gaps in urban and rural wages and salaries and make appropriate recommendations in the light of inflation and Government income policy. It is also expected to review minimum wages and price and rent control measures and practices, and advise Government on ways to narrow income differentials between skilled and unskilled labour in the formal sector and between rural and urban workers.

(ii) The Minimum Wages Advisory Board

Five Minimum Wages Councils were established in 1974 in response to a 1969 legislation. These were:

- Building and Construction Wages Council

- Hotel and Catering Wages Council

1/ Functions of this Unit are considered later in the paper when government cross-sectoral organs are being described.

- Garage and Motor Trade Wages Council
- Wholesale and Retail Distributive Trades Wages Council
- Manufacturing Trades Wages Council.

Each consisted of an equal number of employer and employee representatives (two on each side) with three independent members, one of whom served as Chairman. According to a review study, prior to 1981 the Council did not in their activities, pursue vigoriously the minimum wage councils' policy objective which calls for a linkage between the level of the statutory minimum wage and average rural income, but instead related the changes to the level of Government's unskilled wage rates 1/

Initially, each of the five Wages Councils met independently and made recommendations to the Minister of Labour and Home Affairs who was empowered to accept or reject the recommendations. As of 1977, the Councils met as a single unit with a major output between 1977 and 1982 being a unified minimum wage rate for all unskilled workers. The apparent success of these joint meetings perhaps led Parliament to abolish the five Councils and replaced them by a single Minimum Wages Advisory Board.

The only amendments to the structure is that unlike the Councils, the Board membership now includes a Government representative with voting rights; the Minister of Labour and Home Affairs is now allowed to amend the Board's recommendations as deemed fit; and the powers of the Board are now limited to proposals on minimum wages only. It is hoped that the Board's activities would ensure that incomes policy issues and in particular level of employment, and costs of employing unskilled labour, are more fully taken into account in Government's development efforts.

(iii) The Salary Review Commission

Prior to 1981, Public Sector wage and salary policy was managed through biennial Salary Review Commissions constituted by Government under the chairmanship of a Cabinet Minister with membership made up of senior public officers.2/ Since 1981 these Commissions are appointed annually. Colclough and Olsen assessed that the first four Commissions were "inconsistant in their application of the policy" 3/. Specific terms of reference are set at the time when the

1/ Colclough, C. and Olsen, P.J.; "Review of Incomes Policy in Botswana: 1972-83"; Gaborone, 1983; p.(ii)

2/ Representatives of the private and parastatal sectors were appointed to the Third Commission in 1978.

3/ Ibid., p.(ii).

Commissions are being constituted. Among the various responsibilities assigned to the Commissions over the years were the following:

- to study and make recommendations on the review study of wages and salaries;
- to review allowances and fringe benefits to ensure that salaries for the professional and technical grades reflect the market value of persons in possession of professional and technical skills;
- to review wages and salaries paid in parastatal organization;
- to study existing income differentials within the civil service and to suggest ways by which salaries can be more closely related to the levels of responsibilities.

(iv) Wages Policy Committee

To implement Government's policy on the regulation of wages and salaries in the private and parastatal sectors, a Wages Policy Committee (WPC) was established in the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning (MFDP) under the chairmanship of the Assistant Minister of Finance and Development Planning. Membership is drawn from MFDP,, the Office of the President, the Directorate of Public Service Management, the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs and the Commissioner of Labour. The Ministry of Finance and Development Planning is also charged with the responsibility to provide the Committee with secretariat services.

Generally the Committee was to ensure that wages and salaries levels in the private and parastatal sectors do not exceed those in Government for comparable employees. The adopted terms of reference of the Committee at the time of its establishment in 1974 were as follows though recently the Committee has been given wider scope of operation to embrace the controlling of gradings in the parastatal sector [1]

- To review proposals for increases in wage rates in the private and parastatal sector, and to determine the extent to which these may be justified in the light of the income; and localisation policies contained in Government White Paper No. 2 and its appendices, together with any subsequent revisions.
- To advise employers of any modifications or additions to these proposals that may be necessary.
- To advise the Minister concerned on the need to establish Wages Councils in any particular sector of the economy and, when necessary, to recommend the re-convening of Wages Councils to review existing wage regulation orders as

1/ Ibid., p.23.

published by the Minister.
- From time to time review the effectiveness with which Governments's Incomes Policy is being implemented, and to propose changes as necessary either in policy, or in the legislative and institutional framework within which it is implemented, to the Minister concerned.

(v) National Industrial Training and Technical Education Committee

In response to the recommendation of the Presidential Commission on Economic Opportunities, the National Industrial and Technical Education Committee was established. The Committee is chaired by the Office of the President, with membership drawn from Government, employers and employees organizations. The Committee is to be responsible for "consultation with industry on course content at training institutions; consultation with industry on trade testing standards; and advising on apprenticeship legislation and industrial training in general" [1]. Subsidary and related to the Committee are two other consultative bodies: The National Technical Education Committee, and the National Advisory Board for Apprenticeship and Industrial Training. Efforts of these consultative bodies are to be geared towards promoting and co-ordinating national technical and vocational training activities with the aim to ensuring that the right balance is stuck between the contents and structure of technical and vocational training and the technical manpower needs and conditions of Botswana. Training Co-ordinators and Manpower Planners in the respective Ministries and the private and parastatal sectors are to provide technical expertise to these bodies and their sub-committees.

(b) Government cross-sector manpower planning organs:

(i) The Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM)

Public sector manpower training and deployment are co-ordinated by the Directorate of Public Service Management. Among its objectives, the Directorate is to ensure self-sufficiency in human resources in the public sector; efficient allocation and utilization of public sector manpower; and raising public sector performance and productivity. The Directorate was re-organized [2] in late 1986 with the following manpower and employment objectives:

(a) Objectively assess the medium and long term public service manpower needs in terms of skills, number, service areas and priorities. Also regularly assess the short-term (annual) public service manpower needs by critically examining the requirements in terms of deployment of the existing manpower.

1/ National Manpower Development Planning 1985, EP4/MFDP, Gaborone, p.30.

2/ Office of the President Circular No. 3 of 1985; DP..20/15/4I/86, Circular No. 3 of 1986.

(b) Maintain a comprehensive and up-to-date public service manpower inventory in terms of skills, experience, deployment, etc. for purpose of manpower planning, utilisation and development.

(c) Ensure that entry, retention and advancement in the Public Service are determined primarily on the basis of merit (relative ability, knowledge and attitudes) and with primary regard to the efficiency of the Public Service.

(d) Ensure optimal utilisation of the Public Service human resource which will be reflected through higher personal productivity, better organisatio organisational performance and effective attainment of the national socio-economic service and developmental goals.

(e) Administer public service related regulations and terms of the service with due regard to the national principles of democracy, development, social justice and harmony and on the basis of sound concepts and practice of human resources management.

(f) Attain complete self sufficiency in the Public Service manpower needs. In this respect administer systematic programmes of public service manpower training and development to develop national capabilities. The training should also result in developing individual potentials, improvement in overall public service performance and attaining localisation objective.

(g) Ensure that the Public Service continuously remain effective and efficient at all levels and is capable of adapting to the national development needs and priorities. In this regard introduce effective measures to combat inefficiency and wastage, promote effieiency and productivity, and achieve optimal utilisation of resources allocated to the Government.

(h) Ensure that the Directorate's overall management and operational systems and procedures are most effective and efficient. In this regard ensure development of professional attitudes and competency among the personnel administrators of all levels within the Public Service. The Directorate will thus serve as a model of excellence in managing its own organisation.

To achieve the above objectives, a number of human resources management functions were allocated to the Directorate. Those functions are grouped under the following broad areas:

- Public Service Manpower Planning
- Public Service Manpower Complement, Grading and Deployment
- Public Service Recruitment

- Public Service Personnel Administration

- Public Service Manpower Training and Development

- Public Service Performance and Productivity Improvement.

(ii) Employment Policy Unit (EPU)

The Unit is located within the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning. In addition to the task of promoting and co-ordinating measures that would enhance employment creation programmes, the EPU is expected to give advice on employment, manpower and incomes policy. Accordingly, the Unit, which is also the Secretariat to the National Employment, Manpower and Incomes Council, has the overall responsibility for (i) analysing the availability of and requirements for various types of labour; and (ii) for monitoring and reporting on the structure and pattern of present and future labour market situation.

The Employment Policy Unit is to "concern itself with the whole range of manpower, employment and productivity issues" . The Unit, headed by an employment coordinator, is assigned duties which include the following[1/]:

- initially to organize consultations with government and with employers and trade unionists' representatives on the revival of the National Employment, Manpower and Incomes Council (NEMIC); the Government's aim is that NEMIC should become an effective tripartite body for overseeing the implementation of its incomes and employment policies;

- subsequently, to provide a secretariat for NEMIC and its sub-committees. This will involve research and preparation of statistical and option papers; liaison with NEMIC members and following up of NEMIC recommendations;

- to asses all significant projects, including parastatal investment proposals, for their impact on employment and productivity; to devise a system of shadow-pricing of labour for use in Government's project evaluation. Similarly to assess other policies, proposed legislation and major private sector investment proposals for their impact on employment. To advise Government through the Division of Economic Affairs and the Ministers of Finance and Development Planning on such matters;

- to monitor levels of employment and productivity and cooperation with the Central Statistical Office in the development of better employment data;

1/ Adopted from "Report on Mission to Botswana", 3-11 March 1981 by S.B. Jones, ECA, Addis Ababa

- to prepare regular reports to the Vice President and Cabinet on the implementation of the employment strategy.

(iii) The Central Statistical Office (CSO)

The Central Statistical Office is located within the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning. It's primary responsibility is to "collect, process, analyse, publish and interpret statistical information to the Government and to the public at large"[1/]. Specialized units have been established to perform the above task. Those that have direct implications for manpower and employment planning are the Units dealing with demography, surveys, labour statistics, education and employment.

The Demographic Unit is responsible for processing, interpreting and publishing information on the demographic characteristics of the population, including population projection, mortality, fertility and growth rates and migration. The Surveys Unit is responsible for implementing the Continous Household Integrated Programme Surveys (CHIPS) which was instituted in 1983. The Unit is also responsible for the production of general social statistics focusing on health, employment, household expenditure, wage etc. The Labour Statistics Unit is established to support and provide input to the areas responsible for the enterprises establishment register, for employment surveys, and for the CHIPS programmes of household surveys. The Unit is also responsible to analyse results of the Labour Force Surveys, Employment Surveys, the Establishment Surveys and any other labour market related surveys carried out by the Survey Unit. The Education Statistics Unit is responsible for collecting, processing and publishing data on primary, secondary, university, teacher training, Botswana students abroad, vocation and technical training institutions. The Unit is to be also concerned with preparing and presenting in more detail disaggregated expenditure on education, handicapped, community junior or secondary schools, brigades, non-formal education and make projections of school age children.

(iv) The Department of Labour and Social Security

As one of its specific objectives, the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs which housed the Department of Labour and Social Security, is to:

> "Improve social and economic welfare of citizens through provision of effective national employment and labour related services covering: administration of national employment policy and programmes, protection of the rights and benefits of the workers, safeguard health and safety at work, promotion of sound industrial relations, promotion of labour productivity and utilization, etc.[2/]"

1/ "Data Sources for Manpower Planning in Botswana", CSO, a paper presented to the National Manpower Planning Seminar in Gaborone, 24-26 May, 1983.

2/ Office of the President Circular No. 3 of 1985; DP. 20/15/4I/86.

The Department is sub-divided into five units: Labour Relations and Welfare; Employment and Productivity; Social Security; Labour Research and Statistics; and Departmental Management Units. Through these units, the Department is expected to:

(a) Develop and after approval, maintain and administer national employment policy and related programmes such as Social security/benefits schemes, provided funds, employment of young and female workers, disabled persons and other socially disadvantages groups.

(b) Administer the Employment, Trade Union, Factories and other labour related Acts.

(c) Through appropriate inspectorate function ensure protection of rights (such as health, minimum wages and conditions of service) and safety of workers.

(d) Through effective labour relations promote healthy industrial environment.

(e) Provide employment service, vocational guidance and industrial training for productive use of labour and attainment of localisation goals, with particular emphasis on promoting improved rural employment conditions.

(f) Undertake research and trade testing to establish sound industrial labour productivity standards.

(g) Develop, introduce and co-ordinate, at national level, regular programmes for promoting labour productivity and utilisation; such programmes to include: training within industry (T.W.I.), compiling and distributing national labour productivity statistics, planning and monitoring of localisation, undertake studies to improve production methods, layout, safety conditions etc.

(h) Systematically develop and introduce effective measures to absorb migrant labour and attain objective of self sufficiency and localisation of manpower.

(c) Government Sectoral Manpower Planning Organs

(i) Department of Health Manpower Development and Utilization

The Department is charged with four broad responsibilities: the setting of health manpower development policy and priorities; health manpower planning; health manpower development; and the deployment and utilization of health manpower. The Department is accordingly sub-divided into three

units: Health Manpower Planning; Health Manpower Development; and Health Manpower Deployment.

More specifically, the Department is expected to:

- develop and monitor a sound health manpower policy for short and long-term use covering all health related disciplines;
- identify health manpower needs, both short and long range, covering all aspects of the health service operations at all levels;
- develop detailed health manpower development plans and programmes to meet the identified needs including setting of training and achievement standards;
- ensure that the approved health manpower development plans are effectively implemented;
- ensure that the health sector manpower is properly distributed and optimally utilised;
- carry out health manpower related research and maintain an up-to-date inventory of health manpower;
- evaluate the relevance and effectiveness of all types of health sector related training programmes.

(ii) The Department of Unified Local Government Service Management

This Department is located within the Ministry of Local Government and Lands. It is primarily responsible for manpower development, personnel management and training for five towns and nine district councils with the view of increasing Local Government field staff productivity, increasing the proportion of educated and qualified staff allocated to local authorities and improve the calibre of Local Government and field staff [1/, 2/]. Human resources management activities entrusted to the Department includes:

- recruiting, placing and developing manpower to meet the specific requirements of the local authorities and their institutions;

1/ Venson, P.; "Manpower Planning for Local Government", paper presented at National Manpower Planning Seminar, 24-26 May, 1983, Gaborone.

2/ National Development Plan 1985-1991; MFDP, Gaborone, 1985, p.78.

- administering service regulations pertaining to staff welfare, career advancement, decipline and terminal benefits to ensure fair treatment and develop high motivation and proficiency;

- determining staff requirements (complement and grading) using appropriate assessment techniques and ensuring optimal utilization of available manpower.

Besides General Administration Units in Ministries and private and parastatal firms, there are a hosts of other Governmental and non-governmental organs that are equally concerned with human resources management activities in Botswana as part of the system. Notably among these are the Ministry of Education particularly through the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department; the Ministry of Commerce; the Botswana Employers' Federation; the Botswana Federation of Trade Unions; and the Botswana Association of Training and Development Officers. In a few cases, these organs do collaborate with the various substantive manpower planning organs in the execution of certain activities. For example the Central Statistical Office and the Ministry of Education jointly conduct an annual survey of all primary and secondary schools, teacher training colleges, brigades and other vocational training centres and the university. Results of these surveys are compiled in the "Education Statistics" published annually by the CSO. Information contained therein show total enrolment by standard, form or year of study, age, sex, number of repeaters and dropouts, size of teaching force by qualification and nationality, and school facilities, all of which are of great importance to the manpower and employment planner.

2. Staffing

Serious attempts have been made at staffing the various organs of Government responsible for manpower and employment planning activities. For the 1986/87 fiscal year, 10 establishments for high-level manpower management offices were approved for the Directorate of Public Service Management, 24 for the Central Statistical Office, 4 for the Employment Policy Unit and 22, 2 and 14 for the Departments of Labour and Social Security, Health Manpower, and the Unified Local Government Service respectively. These aggregates are broken down by super-scale staff who are directly involved in the day-to-day operation of the Departments, and Advisors, usually on short-term assignment to fill the professional and technical manpower gap.

A review of the 1986/87 breakdown of establishment and posts shows that the Directorate of Public Service Management is allocated two establishment professional posts. Two advisory posts and three professional posts are allocated to the Employment Policy Unit with only one staff in post by the end of 1986. The corresponding numbers of posts allocated to CSO are relatively high amounting to twenty professionals and three advisers though one should view these with care since the unavailability of information has made it difficult to show their distribution among the four key units that are directly responsible for manpower and employment planning activities.

The Department of Health Manpower is only allocated one professional post and one superscale post despite the scope of its responsibilities, while the Department of the Unified Local Government Service Management is allocated eleven professional posts and one technical post in addition to two superscale posts. The nature and distribution of these posts and establishments are shown in the following table:

Table 7: Number of Public Sector Managerial, Professional and Technical Post available for Manpower and Employment Planning in Botswana: 1985/86 and 1986/87

Department, Level and Post	Establishment 1985/86	Establishment 1986/87
1. Directorate of Public Service Management	10	10
Superscale staff		
Director of Personnel	1	1
Deputy Director	1	1
Assistant Director	4	4
Professional Staff		
Sr. Planning Officer	1	1
Planning Officer	1	1
Advisers, Experts		
Manpower Planning Advisor	1	1
Job Analyst	1	1
2. Central Statistical Office	23	23
Superscale Staff		
Government Statistician	1	1
Professional Staff		
Principal Statistician	1	2
Sr. Statistician	6	6
Energy Statistician	1	1
Labour Statistician	1	1
Assistant Statistician	2	2

Table 7 cont'd.....

Department, Level and Post	Establishment 1985/86	1986/87
Advisers, Experts		
Data Processing Expert - Census	1	1
Demographer/Analyst	1	1
National Accounts Expert	1	1
3. Employment Policy Unit	4	4
Superscale Staff		
Employment Co-ordinator	1	1
Professional Staff		
Sr. Economist	2	2
Assistant Economist	1	1
4. Department of Labour and Social Security	20	22
Superscale Staff		
Commissioner of Labour	1	1
Deputy Commissioner of Labour	1	1
Chief Inspector of Factories	1	1
Professional Staff		
Director of Apprenticeship and Industrial Training	1	1
Technical Staff		
Principal Industrial Training Officer	1	1
Sr. Industrial Training Officer	2	4
Chief Testing Officer	1	1
Sr. Testing Officer	6	8
Sr. Inspector of Factories	1	1
Inspector of Factories	1	1
Assistant Inspector of Factories	1	1
Driving Instructor	1	1

Table 7 cont'd.....

Department, Level and Post	Establishment 1985/86	1986/87
Advisers, Experts		
Labour Administration Advisor	1	-
Apprenticeship and Trade Testing Advisor	1	-
5. Department of Health Manpower	2	2
Superscale Staff		
Under Secretary, Health Manpower	1	1
Professional Staff		
Assistant Health Manpower Planning Officer	1	1
6. Department of the Unified Local Government Service	14	14
Superscale Staff		
Establishment Secretary	1	1
Deputy Establishment Secretary	1	1
Professional Staff		
Course Director	1	1
Lecturer/Assistant Lecturer	7	7
Senior Lecturer	1	1
Lecturer	2	2
Technical Staff		
Instructor	1	1

The figures in the table do not tell the whole story. Hidden are a number of issues whose analysis would have allowed one to better assess the staffing capabilities of the process. First, there is a high dependency on non-Batswana for occupying the professional and technical posts which is not apparent from the table. Secondly, the table does not reflect the huge number of allocated posts that are vacant resulting from shortages of suitable candidates and manpower losses to the private and parastatal sectors.

Thirdly, nothing is said in the table about the level of training and work experience, work attitude, tenure on the job and specific functions performed by the staff in post. The absence of these assessment indicators is perhaps one of the greatest limitations in this review exercise which consequently suggest the need for a manpower and employment planning staff assessment and training needs study. Findings from such a study could form the basis for future efforts in strengthening the institutional components of the human resources management process in Botswana.

IV. MANPOWER AND EMPLOYMENT PLANNING ACTIVITIES IN BOTSWANA

Government's efforts in systematic manpower and employment planning can be assessed not only by the institutions established, but also by the nature, type and frequency of manpower and employment planning activities undertaken by those institutions. The importance of this is that activities do constitute the lubricant in the process to make it functional. In the case of Botswana, several activities related to the planning function within the human resources management system have been initiated over the years. These activities take on different forms ranging from the setting of policies and programmes to conducting studies, workshops and seminars.

One of the most significant activities undertaken is the inclusion of population, labour force and employment issues in the mid-review exercise of the Fifth National Development Plan as well as in the preparation of the Sixth National Development Plan. Of equal significance is that since the early seventies, the Government has initiated a number of policies and programmes to address issues relating to employment creation and income redistribution. These include (i) the 1972 National Policy on Incomes, Employment, Prices and Profits in view of the need to restrain wages in the formal sector so as to maximize employment opportunities; (ii) the 1973 National Policy on Rural Development to deal with the twin priority objectives of job creation and rural development; (iii) the 1977 National Policy on Education aimed at expanding educational facilities and making it more relevant for development; (iv) the 1982 Financial Assistance Policy with an objective to generate additional employment opportunities through the promotion of economically viable activities; and (v) the 1982 National Policy on Economic Opportunities to ensure the promotion of employment and effective participation of Batswana in the economic development process.

To support the above actions, several technical activities are initiated and undertaken. The nature and scope of the major ones are briefly considered below.

1. The National Manpower Development Planning Activity

The Government instituted the National Manpower Development Planning Activity in 1982.

Objectively, the activity is to provide a national picture of the labour market situation and its future prospects in Botswana and thereby serve as a basis for designing employment creation and human resources development and utilization policies and strategies. Operationally, the activity involves analyzing the availabilities of and requirements for various types of labour within the citizen labour force by occupational, sectoral, educational and training categories.1/

Accordingly, the activity is aimed at guiding policy makers on the requirements for, and the availabilities of, specific categories of manpower. With this focus, the scope of the National Manpower Development Planning activity includes the analysis of:

- the citizen labour force by occupational, educational and training categories;
- the manpower requirements by sectoral, occupational, educational and training categories;
- the various education and training programmes to develop manpower; and
- several of the employment promotion policies in existence or available to the nation.

The substantive output of the activity is an annual report prepared by the Employment Policy Unit in the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning. The report highlights policy implication and direction for human resources development and employment creation within the framework of Government's four main development objectives: "rapid economic growth, social justice, economic independence and sustained development"2/. A number of agencies assist the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning in generating the needed data for undertaking the national manpower development planning activity. These include the Central Statistical Office, the Ministry of Education, the Directorate of Personnel, the Department of Labour, the Department of Unified Local Government Service and the Ministry of Agriculture. It would be most useful if such assistance was obtained from all other organs involved with manpower planning, development and utilization programmes.

2. Public Sector Manpower Budgeting

A manpower budgeting process was introduced in the Botswana Public Service in 1979 with two primary objectives: one, to optimize the use and distribution of scarce human resources within the public service, and two to rationalize

1/ "National Manpower Development Planning 1983: A second Report", Government of Botswana, Gaborone, 1983, p.1.

2/ "National Development Plan V". Government of Botswana, p.61.

and monitor the growth rate of public service employment in relation to the availability of human and financial resources. Underlying these objectives, is the Government's desire to make the public service more efficient in the light of national employment and manpower development needs, policies, strategies and opportunities as determined by the national development plan.

Though the process is constrained by many factors, it is fuctional and impressive. At the beginning of a plan period, manpower ceiling for each Department is established based primarily on manpower in post and the financial growth during that period. In addition, an Allocation Committee meets annually to allocate university graduates to the various sectors on the basis of Departmental submission, which indicates the Department's manpower requirements and training plans, in conjunction with recommendations from the various relevant sub-committees. This process is often subject to extensive negotiations between the concerned ministry, the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning and the Directorate of Public Service Management. As far as monitoring the process is concerned, attention is focused on the need to ensure that the aggregate expenditure ceiling is not exceeded and that the allocation of resources to Ministries and Departments do reflect the plan's objectives.

3. Employment Surveys

Since 1971 the Central Statistical Office has been conducting Employment Surveys. Initially, the Survey was a census of businesses; but became a sample survey begining 1979 as the number of businesses increased. Presently, all establishments employing at least 50 persons at the beginning of the survey period and all new establishments are 100 per cent sampled with a 30 per cent sample drawn from the rest to form the survey size. Questionnaires are mailed to respondents with a minimum of follow-up activities. Information required of the respondents are:

- type of business activity
- location of business activity
- number of persons employed by sex and citizenship
- payments of wages, salaries, bonuses etc.
- number of persons leaving and joining the establishment
- number of persons employed by job title/description, by basic monthly earnings and citizenship
- minimum education/training/working experience required for each job.

The coverage of the Survey includes the Central Government, Local Government, education service and all formally registered businesses. Excluded are traditional farmers, domestic workers and all other unregistered informal sector activities. The Government sector is also 100 per cent sampled with

the data obtained from payroll files thus making it difficult to have the employees classified by occupational classification. An Employment Survey Report is published containing some of the major tabulations of the survey results. Aggregate statistics showing the following by region and industry are usually contained in the Report:

- total number of employees and working proprietors by sex, citizenship and industry
- payments to employees by citizenship and industry
- number of employees by occupation, citizenship, level of earnings and average hours worked per week. (Occupation at 3 digit level of ISCO)
- number of persons employed by minimum education and training and working experience required for the job by citizenship
- labour turnover
- tabulations on regions, etc.

4. Labour Force Survey

The Central Statistical Office through the Labour Statistics Unit, is charged with the responsibility to conduct periodic Labour Force Surveys.

Generally, the Labour Force Survey programme is intended to generate comprehensive and up-to-date statistical information on the working population, their conditions of work and the labour market. It is expected that the Survey would generate the necessary data to facilitate manpower and employment planning efforts. The first extensive and comprehensive survey of this type was conducted from 1 May 1984 to 30 April 1985. The 1984/85 Labour Force Survey provided vital information to supplement those obtained from the employment surveys. These included up-to-date information on the number of people employed and unemployed, the participation rates and the educational attainment of the labour force classified by sector. The Survey also identified several categories of workers in the formal and informal sectors by their employment characteristics.

5. Education Survey

The CSO and the Ministry of Education conduct annual surveys of all primary and secondary schools, teachers training colleges, brigades and other vocational training centres and the University of Botswana as well as Batswana students abroad. For primary and secondary schools and the teacher training colleges, four sets of returns on enrolment are received annually with the first term return completed on the end of the second week of the first

term; the second and third term returns, completed on the last day of the second and third terms; the annual return, completed on the first working day of April. The other institutions just submit the annual return, which is more detailed than the terminal returns. Information on students abroad is compiled from records of the Bursaries unit (Ministry of Education) and the Directorate of Personnel.

All the information collected in the annual return is compiled in the Education Statistics, an annual publication of the Central Statistics Office. Figures for each level of education show: total enrolment broken down by standard form or year of study, age and sex; number of repeaters and drop-outs (in the case of primary and secondary schools); size of the teaching force by qualifications and nationality; facilities available to schools e.g. classrooms, laboratories, etc.

6. National Workshops and Seminars

A National Manpower Planning Workshop was held in April of 1981 with the assistance of the Institute of Development Management (IDM) and the United Nations EconomicCommission for Africa (UNECA). Participants dealt with manpower planning issues particularly those relating to the differences between skilled and knowledge workers and their implications on existing and future education and training systems. Two years later, May 1983, the workshop was followed by a National Manpower Planning Seminar. During this exercise, participants considered a number of issues relating to the quality and usefulness of manpower planning process in Botswana; the co-ordination of activities and co-operation among the various manpower planning organs and how best these activities can be integrated into the National Manpower Planning Activity; and the relationship between manpower planning and the design and implementation of employment, education, training and other related policies. Discussion on these issues were focused on four major policy areas: institutional arrangement; localization of the workforce; employment generation and constraints; and education and training.

Plans are underway to hold a National Training Workshop on public service manpower planning and allocation in March 1987 with the assistance of UNECA. The ultimate objective of the workshop would be to optimize the utilization of public service manpower by enhancing the level of effectiveness in the development and allocation of public service personnel within the framework of the sixth National Development Plan 1985-1991. Operationally, the workshop would seek to

- strengthen staff and institutional capabilities for the identification of public service manpower requirements and training needs by upgrading skills of ministries training coordinators and manpower planning officers who would in turn coordinate and train respective departmental personnel responsible for manpower budgeting and development;

- improve the manpower budgeting process by reviewing and updating existing forms and procedures for the preparation of manpower targets and submission of manpower requests;

- identify 4 year manpower requirements for the public sector.

7. Studies

A number of independent studies on manpower and related issues have been undertaken. Notable among these are (i) the 1973 Colclough Study entitled "Manpower and Employment in Botswana"; (ii) the 1983 study on Manpower Requirements and the Botswana Polytechnic and the Brigades; (iii) the 1983 study on training for the mines. Other important studies include the study entitled "Management and Productivity by Tsa Badiri Consultancy and the Lipton study entitled "Employment and Labour Use in Botswana". Findings of these and other studies have, among other things, provided valuable guidance in the formulation of manpower development and utilization policies and programmes in Botswana.

In short, the process of manpower and employment planning has indeed been put into motion in Botswana in the light of the above activities. Concious efforts are being made to expand the scope of these activities. More efforts need to be taken towards the development and deployment of manpower specifically labour statisticians and economists education, employment and manpower planners; the storage and analysis of relevant information and data, and the harmonization and integration of activities.

V. EFFECTIVENESS OF THE PROCESS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR THE FUTURE

1. Major Observations

Though the necessary systems to plan, produce and utilize domestic manpower began at a very low base at independence, pressing manpower and employment planning issues have been identified by the Government of Botswana and appropriate policy and strategy guidelines established. This is indeed a major step taken within the process of human resources development and utilization planning. Another major step of the process is the establishment of institutional capabilities to pursue the policies and execute the strategies. Again, the Government has made serious attempts at taking this step. As shown in the preceeding section, advisory/consultative bodies have been established which are supported by a number of inter-sectoral and sectoral human resources management organs. Also in taking this step, activities to facilitate manpower and employment planning have been initiated.

The next and most crucial step deals with ensuring managerial and professional capabilities within the created institutions to plan, programme and execute

the elements of the policies and strategies. This aspect involves the determination of measurable work programme, staffing, co-ordinating, monitoring and administering. Taking of this step has been constrained greatly thereby limiting the effectiveness of the process despite the laudible efforts being made in putting the process into motion.

First, the process is constrained by the lack of adquate staff to effectively perform the given functions. While nothing objective can be said in this paper about the quality and productivity levels of those in post, it would be desirable to augment the number of professional staff in most of the existing organs particularly the Directorate of Public Service Management, the Department of Health Manpower and the Employment Policy Unit. Secondly, the process is constrained by the absence of manpower planning units in the various ministeries along the lines of the established Department of Health Manpower in the Ministry of Health. Their absence amounts to "missing links" within the process and hence one which is operating at sub-optimum level. The overlapping of delegated functions and in some cases, the generalities of the terms of references have not only constrained the process; but have also created difficulties in evaluating the process. For example, it seems as though little thoughts were given to the existence of NEMIC, (which was actually dormant at that time) when the five Minimum Wages Councils and subsequently the Advisory Board were established. With the reactivation of NEMEC little was again done to adjust the Board's terms of reference to link with those of the Council. These observations could be said in the cases of the Salary Review Commissions and the National Wages Policy Committee.

Besides the direct impact of the above constraints, the process itself seems to be limited in its scope from two view points. First, activities executed are largely concentrated on the income variable in the utilization side of the human resources management equation. In addition to down playing the development side of the equation, activities undertaken have little to do with other major variables on the utilization side such as productivity and manpower allocation and distribution in the non-public sector. Secondly, the planning functions for both sides of the equation is either highly compartmentalized in some areas, dis-integrated for the private and parastatal sector or non-existent. These limitations do not only create gaps within the process, they also create obstacles to Government in the development of a coherent and comprehensive human resources planning machinery.

On the whole, one could conclude that relatively, the process of human resources management in Botswana has reached a "take-off" stage. There is room and willingness on the part of the Government to create the necessary institutional and staffing capabilities to complete the mechanics of the system and thereby improve its performance. To assist in this endeavour, the following suggestions are hereby advanced for consideration.

2. Suggestions for strengthening national human resources planning capabilities

The National Incomes, Manpower and Employment Council (NIMEC) should be revamped to guide, determine and account for the implementation of national human resources development and utilization policies and programmes. To facilitate this, Council members should not only assume advisory roles; but should also be responsible for ensuring the implementation of human resources management policies and programmes. This means that members should be equally asked to report at regular meetings, on their respective on-going and planned programmes relative to the implementation of adopted policies and strategies. Consequently the Council's terms of reference should be reviewed and strengthened in the light of other existing advisory bodies and sub-committees to ensure that it would:

- Stipulate guidelines for and approve targets, policies, programmes and strategies for the efficient development and utilization of the nation's human resource;

- Study, harmonize and co-ordinate measures that would motivate and ensure an adequate supply of and demand for quality manpower within sectors and occupations;

- Receive and review periodic reports on the status and problems of human resource development and utilization institutions and programmes.

One of the implications of this new role is the need to enlarge the scope, functions and capabilities of the Employment Policy Unit (EPU) which is expected to provide the Council with secretariat services. Also, there would be the need to establish manpower planning units in the various ministries and parastatal enterprises. A ten-year development programme should therefore be initiated to evolve a machinery that is capable to develop, manage policies and programmes and to collect, process , and analyse and report relevant data. Again, the EPU should play a lead and co-ordinating role. Accordingly, it should be elevated to a departmental level with two substantive units. One for policy and programmes development, and the other for surveys and information.

The policy and programme unit should be primarily concerned with macro planning issues related to (i) overall policy analysis, formulation and co-ordination; (ii) human resources development planning; and monitoring. The Unit dealing with Surveys and information should be concerned with (i) the various manpower surveys, assembling both survey and administrative data; and (ii) dessimenating relevant manpower statistics. Specific terms of reference for the concerned officers manning the institutions will have to be established successively over the ten year plan period. This will not only guide the designing of the organizational structure; but shall also provide guidance for staff recruitment and staff development. It is suggested that among the general activities to be covered by these terms of reference are the following:

A. Policy and programme development and management

(a) policy and programme formulation, co-ordination and evaluation
- preparation of plans and projects
- monitoring and evaluating manpower and education plans and programmes
- analysing aggregate economic conditions and plans

(b) Planning human resources development
- formulation of alternative education plans, strategies, programmes and guidelines
- formulation of alternative vocational and technical training plans, strategies, programmes and guidelines
- formulation of plans, strategies, programmes and guidelines for other social factor inputs for a quality human resource base such as health, food, physical education, etc.

(c) Planning human resource utilization
- formulation of alternative labour productivity enhancement strategies, programmes and guidelines
- formulation of alternative employment and job creation and distribution plans, strategies, programmes and guidelines
- formulation of alternative measures for vocational guidance, career guidance and development and occupational testing.

B. Data gathering, processing and reporting

(a) Organization and execution of manpower, education and employment surveys and other data collection devices
- development and utilization of survey instruments and sampling frames
- development and utilization of administrative data collection forms and procedures

(b) Processing and tabulating manpower, employment and education data
- coding, punching, listing and tabulating data
- printing, storing and publishing manpower, education, employment plans, information and policy statements.

As a plan of action, it is suggested that a working group to be headed by the Chairman of NEMIC, be established to consider these and other suggestions and make the necessary recommendations and plan for evolving an integrated comprehensive human resources management system over the next ten years. The working group could request external assistance in its work particularly with regards to the formulation and preparation of project proposals to support the work of the group. What needs to be kept in mind, is that the long-term development by Botswana, which involves the achievement of rapid economic growth, social justice, economic independence and sustained development, depends on the extent to which the country's vital human resources are planned, developed and utilized.